



Tracey Lee
Chief Executive

Plymouth City Council
Civic Centre
Plymouth PL1 2AA

Please ask for Helen Rickman,
Democratic Support Officer
T 01752 398444
E helen.rickman@plymouth.gov.uk
www.plymouth.gov.uk/democracy
19 September 2013

WORKING PLYMOUTH

PARK AND RIDE BUS SERVICE REVIEW

Monday 30 September 2013
3.30 pm
Council House, Plymouth (Next to the Civic Centre)

Members:
Councillor Murphy, Chair
Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Ball, Darcy, Drean and Wheeler.

Members are invited to attend the above meeting to consider the items of business overleaf.

This is the first of four review meetings for this Park and Ride Bus Service Review.

Tracey Lee
Chief Executive

WORKING PLYMOUTH

AGENDA

PART I – PUBLIC MEETING

1. APOLOGIES

To receive apologies for non-attendance by panel members.

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Members will be asked to make any declarations of interest in respect of items on this agenda.

3. CHAIR'S URGENT BUSINESS

To receive reports on business which, in the opinion of the Chair, should be brought forward for urgent consideration.

4. COOPERATIVE REVIEW: PARK AND RIDE BUS SERVICE:

- 4.1. Cooperative Review Request Form **(Pages 1 - 2)**
- 4.2. Cooperative Review Project Plan **(Pages 3 - 6)**
- 4.3. Introduction and briefing report **(Pages 7 - 14)**
- 4.4. Draft survey for Park and Ride Bus Service Usage **(Pages 15 - 18)**

5. EXEMPT BUSINESS

To consider passing a resolution under Section 100A (4) of the Local Government Act 1972 to exclude the press and public from the meeting for the following item(s) of business on the grounds that it (they) involve(s) the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph(s) of Part I of Schedule 12A of the Act, as amended by the Freedom of Information Act 2000.

PART II (PRIVATE MEETING)

AGENDA

MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC TO NOTE

that under the law, the Panel is entitled to consider certain items in private. Members of the public will be asked to leave the meeting when such items are discussed.

NIL.

REQUEST FOR A COOPERATIVE REVIEW



Please submit this document to Democratic Support once complete.

The request will be submitted to the Co-operative Scrutiny Board for consideration against the approval criteria and you will be notified of its success. If the Board approve the request for a Co-operative Review on the subject matter below then a project plan will be completed and you may be asked for further information.

What is the name of the review?	Park and Ride Bus Service
Please provide a brief outline of the subject and scope of the review?	A review of the current operating model with due regard to the legal and financial framework, to include service operation, costs, income, maintenance and benchmarking with other operating models elsewhere
Please outline the reasons as to why you believe a review needs to take place?	A review could bring about a more effective and efficient operating model
What will the review attempt to achieve?	Possible efficiency savings. clear outcomes. Enhanced service for customers, greater usage resulting in reduced car congestion/ carbon reduction
Who will benefit from the review?	Plymouth City Council. Park and Ride users and potential users including visitors to the city
How long do you think the review might take?	Two or three meetings
When do you think the review should commence and why?	July 2013. to begin as soon as possible to allow for other reviews to take place later in the year
When do you think the review should be completed by and why?	End summer 2013
Review requested by?	Chair and Vice Chair of Working Plymouth scrutiny panel

Received in Democratic Support Section:	Reviewed by the Co-operative Scrutiny Board:
Date:	Date:
Scrutiny Review Approved/Rejected	
If approved initial Project Plan meeting date:	

This page is intentionally left blank

CO-OPERATIVE REVIEW PROJECT PLAN

[PARK & RIDE]



Background	
Chair:	Councillor Murphy
Lead Officer:	Andy Sharp, Public Transport Manager supported by Gill Peele, Working Plymouth Lead Officer
Democratic Support Officer:	Helen Rickman
Membership:	Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Ball, Darcy, Drean, Murphy and Wheeler.
Relevant Cabinet Member:	Councillor Mark Coker
Date review approved by the Co-operative Scrutiny Board:	10 July 2013
Summary of subject to be reviewed:	The City's Park & Ride services incorporating a review of the service operation, costs, incomes, maintenance and benchmarking with operating models elsewhere.
Reason(s) and rationale for the review:	<p>The city's Park & Ride network has evolved over the last 20 years This review aims to understand the background and rationale for the current operating model and to identify whether there are any opportunities for improvements.</p> <p>The Park and Ride began with the Milehouse site in 1991 followed by Coypool in 1996. From March 2006 services began from the George Junction interchange calling at the Milehouse site en route to the City Centre.</p> <p>First Devon & Cornwall Buses were awarded the Park and Ride contract in November 2005 and from November 2010, at the end of the contract, assumed commercial operation of services PR1 George Junction and Milehouse and PR2 Coypool to the city centre. The City Council continues to be responsible for all site costs, maintenance and Non- Domestic Rates</p> <p>Target Travel currently operates service PR3 under contract to the City Council utilising s106 developer funding. The service provides a link between The George Junction, Marjons, Derriford Hospital and the Tamar Science Park. Existing funding for this service expires in November 2013.</p> <p>Car parking is free at all three sites and customers pay on the bus or use their concessionary bus passes.</p>

	Currently only the Coypool site regularly reaches full capacity. The Council has considered options to expand capacity at this site. However the Sherford New Town includes a large Park & Ride site at Deep Lane End and this will have an impact on usage at Coypool.
Objectives of the review:	To review the Park and Ride scheme in Plymouth and how it is operating
What will the review look at?	Current Service provision, the City Council's strategy and priorities Operators' views and judgements, and benchmarks against other comparable cities
Which areas will be excluded from the review?	Commercially sensitive information
What City and Council Priorities does the review relate to:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Deliver Growth • Raise Aspirations • Reduce Inequality • Provide Value for Communities
Identify links to other Council policies, projects or strategies:	<p>Pioneering Plymouth: in reducing the city's Carbon footprint and leading in environmental responsibility</p> <p>Caring Plymouth: children, young people and adults are safe and confident in their communities</p> <p>Confident Plymouth: citizens enjoy living and working in Plymouth</p>
Who will benefit from the review:	Plymouth City Council and council tax payers, Park and Ride users and potential users including visitors to the city

Methodology

The method and approach of the review:	<p>Site Visits</p> <p>Interviewing Experts – Council Officers and bus operators</p> <p>Interviewing Service Users</p> <p>Comparisons and benchmarking</p>
Witnesses and experts:	<p>To be considered from;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Senior Managers/Chief Officers; • Service users; • External partners • First Devon & Cornwall, Target Travel, Derriford Hospital, City Centre Company, City Bus
Co-opted representatives:	None
Documents and/or reports for analysis e.g. internal/external reports or legislation):	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Government guidance or legislation; • Local policies and strategies i.e. LTP3 • Performance plans and performance indicators;

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consultation exercise evidence; • Budget data; • Briefing report to include Legal framework, commercial risk, cost benefit analysis, patronage figures, existing benchmarking • Maintenance costs
Site visits:	As required to all three park and ride sites.
Consultations/Research:	N/A
Publicity:	To be agreed.
Evaluation method	<p>Evidence based</p> <p>The recommendations of the review will be provided to the Cooperative Scrutiny Board for review in December 2013; the Working Plymouth panel will review the progress and the Working Plymouth Panel will undertake a progress review later in the year.</p>
Resource Requirements:	<p>When considering resource requirements you should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Travel costs • Approximate officer hours to write reports, attend meetings, research information, write the final report
Barriers and Risks:	First Devon & Cornwall fail to provide meaningful data on patronage, costs and revenue due to concerns over commercial sensitivity.

Timetable

Activity	Timescale / Date(s)	Intended Outcome(s)
Meeting 1:	Monday 30 September 2013, 3.30pm	To review a briefing report that will include information on benchmarking charges, the legal framework, factors impacting commercial risk, patronage numbers, maintenance costs, concessionary bus pass data. Members will also finalise the draft questionnaire for the site visit.
Site Visit	To be arrange for the second week of October 2013	To visit all three Park and Ride sites – Members will ask members of the public to complete a brief survey.
Meeting 2:	Monday 28 October 2013, 3.30pm	To review the analysed results of the survey and their implications for the review and identify any other information required. To agree witnesses and experts to be invited to the next meeting.
Meeting 3:	Monday 18 November 2013, 3pm	<p>Witnesses/ experts to attend.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • First Bus, Target Travel, City Bus, Travelwatch South West. • Assistant Director for Transport, Cabinet Member for Transport
Meeting 4:	Monday 2 December 2013, 3.30pm	Conclusion and recommendations.

Draft report:	Written and agreed by 6 December 2013.	
Meeting 5 (approve report):		
Submit report to the Co-operative Scrutiny Board Meeting:	18 December 2013.	
Submit to Cabinet Meeting:	14 January 2014.	
Submit to other bodies/organisations:		
Scrutiny Panel to evaluate and track the outcomes of the Co- operative Review:	Late 2014.	

PARK & RIDE BUS SERVICE

Scrutiny Panel Report



1. Introduction

Plymouth has a range of Park & Ride services. PR1 links Milehouse and the George Junction sites with the city centre whilst PR2 links Coypool to the City Centre, and both are operated by First Devon and Cornwall. PR3 links the George Junction site with the University of St Mark and St John and Derriford Hospital, and is operated under contract by Target Travel.

2. Strategic purpose of Plymouth's Park and Ride services

Plymouth's Third Local Transport Plan (LTP3) places a strategic importance on the need for a park and ride services as an intervention for those driving into the city. The strategy acknowledges that the *'more cars intercepted at park and ride sites, the greater the benefits to the city in terms of reductions in traffic levels, congestion, pollution and reduced parking pressure.'* The strategy also makes specific reference to the importance of striking a balance between offering competitive fares balanced with city centre parking charges whilst not abstracting from other local bus services. The sites effectively work to intercept traffic before heading into the City Centre. Whilst Coypool and the George Junction are well located to achieve this aim the close proximity of Milehouse to the city centre means the benefits are more limited from this site.

3. Current Operation

The PR1 and PR2 bus services have operated without financial subsidy from the Council since November 2010. This is very rare with only a handful of other locations in the UK having a commercial park and ride bus service. Plymouth's service may be unique in the country as the only Park and Ride which actually charges the operator to serve the sites. The PR3 is operated under contract utilising section 106 funding.

The three sites are managed and maintained by the Council including having responsibility for all costs associated with the maintenance and national non domestic rates (NNDR). The total cost for all sites is £178,447. However, this is partly offset by the Plymouth NHS Trust who contribute a third of the NNDR charge for the George Junction and a payment from First Devon and Cornwall of £0.75 per service departure from the Milehouse and Coypool sites. Charges are not applied to the George Junction as it was designed as a bus interchange and other services are encouraged to use it. There is also income from the Motorcycle training school at Coypool.

Table 1: Park & Ride Site income and expenditure in 2012/13

Site	Expenditure (£)	Income (£)	Total site cost (£)
George Junction	83,764	18,355	65,409
Coypool	52,471	17,958	34,513
Milehouse	42,212	13,158	29,054
Totals	178,447	49,471	128,976

Passengers pay on the bus for single or return journeys and English National Concessionary Bus Passes can be used within the scheme times which in the case of park and ride are after 0930 Monday to Friday and any time on a Saturday.

First Devon and Cornwall staff the building and waiting area at the George Junction and provide intermittent site supervision at Milehouse and Coypool.

4. Service usage data

Table 2 shows the total number of passengers which is split by concessionary pass holders over the last 28 months with a forecast full year for the current financial year. It should be noted that the PR3 frequency was doubled and newer branded buses introduced in November 2012 utilising section 106 funding which has led to the significant increase in passengers. Last year 44% of all Park and Ride journeys made in Plymouth were by concessionary pass holders.

Table 2: Total Passengers using each service

	2011/12		2012/13		2013/14 Year to date	
	Total	Concessions	Total	Concessions	Total	Concessions
PR1	644,070	301,910	632,522	286,444	224,337	86,019
Full Year Forecast	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	673,011	258,057
PR2	294,408	128,103	312,555	129,415	119,483	44,288
Full Year Forecast	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	358,449	132,864
PR3	50,037	23,829	78,834	35,494	37,302	17,769
Full Year Forecast	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	111,906	53,307

5. Summary of Appendix A: Benchmarking of Park and Ride sites

26 Local Authorities or cities with park and ride services around England were asked about their operating model. The results were varied;

Concessionary Travel

- 17 locations accept concessionary pass holders.
- 4 locations do not accept concessionary passes at all and offer no discount.
- 5 locations do not offer free travel to concessionary pass-holders but offer a discounted fare.

Parking

- 22 locations do not charge to park.
- 3 locations charge to park with travel included in the price.
- 1 location (Oxford) charge to park in addition to the bus fare.

6. Concessionary Travel

The English National Concessionary Travel Scheme follows primary legislation to permit free travel on all local bus services within England from 0930 to 2300 Monday to Friday and at any time over weekends and bank holidays for anyone of pensionable age or those who are disabled and meet set eligibility criteria. Each time a journey is made the Local Transport Authority responsible for the area the passenger boards reimburses the bus operator a set fee. As the Park and Ride services in Plymouth are registered as local bus services they have been included in the concessionary travel scheme since it started. However, in 2009 an amendment known as The Travel Concessions (Eligible Services) (Amendment) 2009 was introduced which clarifies eligible services and gives Local Transport Authorities the option to make changes should they wish to. One of these clarifications is detailed below and explains a service could be exempt if an amenity element is included within the fare. In the case of Park and Ride's this may include the provision of car parking.

Direct quote from The Travel Concessions (Eligible Services) (Amendment) 2009

"4.—(1) A service is not an eligible service under section 146 of the Transport Act 2000

if—...

(e) the fare for the service includes a special amenity element.

7. Other uses of the sites

George Junction – Car boot sales

Coypool – Motorcycle Training School, ad hoc charity events, potential cycle hire scheme, Plym Valley Railway staff and users, and the Speedway.

Milehouse – Central Park users, Plymouth Argyle matchday parking.

Appendix A: Benchmarking of Park and Ride sites

Local Authority	Concessionary Passes (ENCTS) Accepted on P & R	Car Parking Charged at P & R Car Park	Notes
Truro	Full Fare before 09.30 £1.00 per person return after 09.30 on production of ENCTS pass	No	
Exeter	Passes accepted after 09.30 on Mon to Fri and at all other times	No	
Oxford	Passes accepted after 09.30	Yes	2 sites are free for up to 11 hours 3 sites are £2.00 per car per day
Taunton	No £2.20 per Adult Day Return	No	Somerset has always excluded ENCTS holders from free travel.
Bristol	Passes accepted after 09.00 on Mon – Fri and all day Saturday Before 09.00 peak return is £4.00	No	
Bath	Valid after 09.00 on Mon to Fri and all other times	No	BNES has Exclusive Licence with First to operate the Bath P & R services
City of York	Full Fare before 09.00 on Mon- Fri Special Concessionary Single fare of 70p after 09.00 and at all other times	No	70p special single fare introduced from Sunday 28 th April 2013

City of Cambridge	Passes valid after 09.30 on Mon – Fri and at all other times. Full fare before 09.30		ENCTS pass holders are NOT entitled to take children under-16 free Cambridge P & R carries 3.65M passengers per year
Derby City	Concessions not accepted at any time	Yes	Charge is per car and then up to 7 persons can travel into Derby for £2.70 per car Single ticket is £1.00
Stoke –on –Trent	Free after 09.30 on Mon to Fri and at all other times	Yes	£3.20 per car and then up to 4 persons travel into Stoke and return No dedicated Park & Ride Bus Services
Durham City	Free to all ENCTS holders after 09.30. Between 07.00 and 09.30 there is a 50p flat fare for holders of County Durham – issued Passes	No	Free parking only for P & R bus users. Those who Park & walk or Park & cycle will receive a Penalty Charge Notice
Weymouth and Dorchester	Free to all passengers	Yes	P & R services are not registered as Local Bus Services
Poole	Yes as P R Service only operates on the 4 Saturdays preceding Christmas	No	Christmas Shoppers P & R on 4 Saturdays only
City of Chester	Full fare before 09.30. Adult Return fare of £2.00 after 09.30 and 2 children under 16 can travel free with ENCTS holder	No	Charge for ENCTS holders introduced from 1 st April 2013
Portsmouth	ENCTS not accepted.	Yes: £2.50 to park car and up to 8 passengers travel on bus	Operates on Saturdays only throughout the year. Customers can hop on/ hop off all day on P & R route within

			Portsmouth
Brighton	Yes, after 09.30 on Mon to Fri and all other times	No	
Leicester City	Free after 09.30 on Mon – Fri and all other times. Before 09.30 charge of £1.50 per ENCTS holder issued by City of Leicester and £3.00 all other English ENCTS	No	
City of Norwich	Full adult fare before 09.30. After 09.30 return fare for ENCTS holders is £1.10	No	Change was made following the 2009 amendment. Reported a number of complaints from residents, a small reduction in concessionary passengers but an overall increase in revenue.
City of Gloucester	Full fare before 09.30 on Mon- Fri. Free travel after 09.30 and at all other times	No	
Preston, Lancashire	Full fare for Senior Citizens before 09.30; special 50p single fare for Disabled holders before 09.30 Free travel for both categories after 09.30	No	
Kingston Upon Hull	ENCTS holders entitled to free travel all day, every day	No	
Nottingham City	On sites served by Nottingham Trams no free travel for non-Nottingham City ENCTS holders at any time Sites served by buses charge full fare before 09.30 and free travel after 09.30 and at all other times	No	7 sites within the City of Nottingham

Ipswich	Full fare before 09.30. Special £1.00 return fare after 09.30 on Mon- Fri and at all other times	No	
Swindon	Full fare before 09.30 Mon- Fri and then free after 09.30 and at all other times	No	Bus Service provided by Thamesdown Transport with some journeys supported by Swindon
Salisbury	Free travel at all times for ENCTS holders	No	Website encourages Park and Walk and Park and Cycle
Stratford Upon Avon	Full fare before 09.30 on Mon- Fri for Non- Resident ENCTS holders Full fare before 09.00 for Local residents Free travel at all other times	No	

This page is intentionally left blank

WORKING PLYMOUTH**COOPERATIVE REVIEW PARK AND RIDE BUS
SERVICE: DRAFT SURVEY**

NAME OF PARK AND RIDE SITEService No.....

1 How often do you travel on Park and Ride?

- Daily
 Weekly
 Monthly
 Less often

2 Do you use other park and ride sites in Plymouth?

- Yes
 No

3 If Yes which ones?

- Coypool
 Milehouse
 George Junction

4 Do you live in Plymouth?

- Yes
 No

5 What is your postcode?

.....

6 What is the purpose of your journey?

- Work
 Shopping
 Medical or similar appointment
 Leisure
 Education
 Other

If Other, please expand

7 Why do you use park and ride?

- Speed and reliability
 Convenience
 Cheaper than driving and parking charges
 Difficulty in finding suitable parking
 Less stressful than driving into the city centre
 No other service to/ from my area
 Other

If Other, please expand

8 How did you get here today?

- Car
- Walk
- Cycle
- Dropped off

9 Do you have a concessionary bus pass?

- Yes
- No

10 Would you use the park and ride if you had to pay a full or discounted fare?

- Yes
- No

11 How would you rate your general experience of the Park and ride service in Plymouth?

- Excellent
- Very good
- Good
- Fair
- Poor
- Very poor
- Don't know

12 Please explain why

.....

13 Do you use other buses in Plymouth?

- Yes
- No

14 If no, why not?

- Cost
- Frequency
- No nearby service
- Quality of service
- Other

If Other, please expand

15 What is your gender?

- Male
- Female
- Prefer not to say

16 Which age group are you in?

- 15 and under
- 16- 24
- 25-34
- 35-44
- 45-54
- 55-64
- 65+

I7 Which ethnic group would you say that you belong to?

White (British or any other white background)

Mixed (White and black Caribbean, white and black African, white and Asian or any other mixed background)

Asian or Asian British (Indian, Pakistani, Bangladeshi or any other Asian background)

Black or black British (Caribbean, African or any other black background)

Chinese

Other ethnic group

Prefer not to say

This page is intentionally left blank